STATE OF ARIZONA FILED

OCT 1 5 1990

STATE OF ARIZONA

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

1

2

3

4

5 6

7

8

9 10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24 25

26

In the Matter of: No. 7158

NATIONAL CASUALTY COMPANY,

CONSENT ORDER

Respondent.

The Department of Insurance ("Department"), having filed a Complaint in the above-captioned case against Respondent National Casualty Company; National Casualty Company having been duly served with a copy of the Complaint; having waived its right to a hearing to contest those charges and to present evidence; having admitted the jurisdiction of the Department; having admitted that the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law are true for purposes of this proceeding only; and having consented to the entry of this Order; the Director of the Department of Insurance makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and enters the following Order:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- Respondent, National Casualty Company of Southfield ("National Casualty"), offers and sells disability Michigan insurance within the meaning of A.R.S. § 20-448(B).
- 2. National Casualty's disability insurance policies are sold to Arizona residents.
- In 1988, National Casualty had a policy of declining applications for insurance from applicants who did not speak English. This policy applied to everyone.

- 4. In 1988, National Casualty received applications from at least three Arizona residents: Xing Zeng, Chi-Yen Zeng and Jie-Wei Feng. Upon learning that these persons did not speak English, National Casualty declined to issue policies to them.
- 5. In April, 1990, National Casualty amended its policy with regard to primary applicants who do not speak English as set forth in Exhibit "A," attached hereto.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Director of Insurance has jurisdiction over National Casualty Company.
- 2. The prior policy of National Casualty to decline, ab initio, all applications of non-English speaking persons constituted unfair discrimination in violation of A.R.S. \$ 20-448(B).
- 3. Grounds exist for the Director to impose a civil penalty under A.R.S. § 20-456(A).
- 4. Grounds existed under the prior policy of National Casualty for the Director to have issued a cease and desist order under A.R.S. § 20-456(B).

ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT,

1. Respondent National Casualty Company cease and desist from denying insurance coverage to non-English speaking persons solely on the basis that they cannot speak English and shall follow the policy as set forth in Exhibit A, attached hereto and

incorporated herein.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2. Respondent National Casualty Company consider the applications of Xing Zeng, Chi Yen Zeng and Wei Tei Feng on the same basis English speaking as applicants, including underwriting requirements. In connection with this Respondent National Casualty Company shall notify the foregoing persons that it will consider their applications on the same basis English speaking persons and will as attempt to complete underwriting thereon. Within forty-five (45) days of the entry of this Order, Respondent shall submit a verified statement to the Director of Insurance that it has complied with this Order.

. 3. Respondent National Casualty Company pay a civil penalty of \$500 pursuant to A.R.S. \$20-456(A)\$.

DATED this 15th day of October , 1990.

SUSAN CALLINGER

Director of Insurance

21

22

23

24

25

26

1. Respondent National Casualty Company has been duly served with the Complaint in this matter, has reviewed the foregoing and is aware of its right to a hearing at which it may be represented by counsel, present evidence and cross-examine witnesses. Respondent has waived its right to a hearing and to any court appeals relating thereto.

- 2. Respondent National Casualty Company admits the jurisdiction of the Arizona Department of Insurance and for the purposes of this proceeding only admits that the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law are true and consents to the entry of the foregoing Order.
- 3. Respondent National Casualty Company states that no promise of any kind or nature whatsoever was made to them to induce them to enter into this Order and that they have entered into it voluntarily.
- 4. Respondent National Casualty company acknowledges that the Arizona Department of Insurance's acceptance of this Order is solely for the purpose of settling this litigation as against them and does not preclude any other agency or officer of this state or subdivision thereof from instituting other civil or criminal proceedings as may be appropriate now or in the future.
- 5. The Department of Insurance, in accepting this Consent Order, has relied on the representations of National Casualty Company that it has changed its policy in offering

coverage solely because an applicant does not speak English. 2 William L. Gulley represents that he is General 3 Counsel of National Casualty Company, and is authorized to enter 4 into the foregoing Consent Order and to bind National Casualty 5 Company to the terms of the Consent Order. 6 7 NATIONAL CASUALTY COMPANY 8 9 10 APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT: 11 12 13 LEON D BESS Attorney for National 14 Casualty Company 15 ROBERT K. CORBIN, Attorney General 16 PATRICK M. MURPHY, Chief Counsel Financial Fraud Division 17 18 19 W. MARK SENDROW Assistant Chief Counsel 20 Department of Insurance 21 COPY of the foregoing mailed 22 this 15th day of October 1990, to: 23 Mark Sendrow

Assistant Chief Counsel

Phoenix, Arizona 85007

1275 West Washington, Room 259

1

24

25

26

coverage to non-English speaking persons and no longer refuses

Joe Hennelly, Deputy Director Mary Butterfield, Supervisor Department of Insurance 3030 North 3rd Street, Suite 1100 Phoenix, Arizona 85012 Leon D. Bess BESS & DYSART, P.C. 2800 North Central, Suite 2080 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-1019 Sunny Yen P.O. Box 17326 Mesa, Arizona 85212 Consent/001

-6-

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1

National Casualty Company will accept and underwrite applications from applicants who do not speak English. the company will still require answers to all medical questions on the application to its satisfaction. If the information disclosed on the application is not satisfactory to the company, it will attempt to conduct a personal history interview with the applicant, as it frequently does in any event, to obtain the necessary information. If the company is unable to get the medical information required, it will take appropriate underwriting action to protect the company as well as the applicant. This policy is necessary to protect against adverse selection and to enable the company to make an informed decision in the risk selection process. National Casualty Company will not decline to underwrite any application solely on the basis the applicant does not speak English.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

25

26

Exhibit "A"