

JUN 24 2008

STATE OF ARIZONA
ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

DEPT OF INSURANCE
BY 

In the Matter of:)
)
HUMANA HEALTH PLAN, INC.)
)
NAIC #95885)
)
Respondent.)

Docket No. 08A-112-INS

CONSENT ORDER

On August 8, 2007 the Arizona Department of Insurance ('Department') called a healthcare insurance compliance examination ('Examination') of Humana Health Plan, Inc. ('Humana' or the 'Company') covering the time period from January 1, 2006 through December 6, 2007 ('Examination Period'). The Examination Period was divided into four six-month periods ('Partial Examination Periods' or 'PEPs') as follows:

PEP 1: January 1, 2006 – June 30, 2006

PEP 2: July 1, 2006 – December 31, 2006

PEP 3: January 1, 2007 – June 30, 2007

PEP 4: July 1, 2007 – December 6, 2007

The Report of the Health Insurance Compliance Examination of Humana Health Plan, Inc. dated March 3, 2008 ('Report'), which is included herein by reference, alleges that Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) §§ 20-2533 through 20-2536, A.R.S. § 20-1074 and A.R.S. § 20-1077. Humana Health Plan, Inc. wishes to resolve this matter without formal proceedings. Humana admits the following Findings of Fact are true and consents to the entry of the following Conclusions of Law solely for the purpose of resolving the allegations contained in the Report and consents to the entry of the following Order.

FINDINGS OF FACT

I. Jurisdiction.

Humana Health Plan, Inc. is, and throughout the Examination Period was, authorized to operate as a health care services organization insurer pursuant to a Certificate of Authority issued by the Arizona Insurance Director ('Director').

II. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals.

- A. During the Examination Period, in 36 of 62 (58% of) appeals, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to provide a health care appeals information packet to the member within five business days after the date the appeal was initiated.
- B. During the Examination Period, in 33 of 62 (53% of) appeals, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to notify the member of the right to appeal or failed to issue an explanation of benefits document that provided the member the correct timeframe to file an appeal.
- C. During the Examination Period, Humana's initial determination letter appeared to provide the company discretion in deciding if an appeal that was certified by a provider would be heard as an expedited appeal.
- D. During PEP 3, in 1 of 1 (100% of) requests for expedited medical review, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to inform the member and the member's treating provider of the expedited decision within one business day.
- E. During PEP 3, in 1 of 1 (100% of) requests for an expedited medical review where there was an adverse decision, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to notify the member or the member's treating provider by telephone and mail

1 of the adverse decision or of the member's option to immediately proceed
2 to an expedited appeal.

- 3 F. During the Examination Period, in 4 of 10 (40% of) requests for informal
4 reconsideration, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to mail a written
5 acknowledgment to the member within five business days after receipt of
6 the request, or failed to mail a written acknowledgment to the member's
7 treating provider within five business days after receipt of the request or
8 failed to do either.
- 9 G. During PEPs 2 and 4, in 2 of 6 (33% of) informal reconsiderations, Humana
10 Health Plan, Inc. failed to mail notice of its decision to the member within
11 thirty days after receipt of a request for informal reconsideration, or to mail
12 notice of its decision to the member's treating provider within thirty days
13 after receipt of a request for informal reconsideration, or to include the
14 criteria used and the clinical reasons for the decision.
- 15 H. During the Examination Period, in 16 of 51 (31% of) formal appeals,
16 Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to mail a written acknowledgment to the
17 member and the member's treating provider within five business days after
18 receipt of the formal appeal.
- 19 I. During PEP 2, in 1 of 5 (20% of) adverse decisions in formal appeals
20 related to denials of claims that had already been provided, Humana
21 Health Plan, Inc. failed to provide written notice of its adverse decision to
22 the member within sixty days after receipt of the written appeal, or failed to
23 notify the member in writing of the utilization review agent's decision and
24 the criteria used and the clinical reasons for that decision.
- 25

1 J. During the Examination Period, in 8 of 23 (35% of) formal appeals, when at
2 the conclusion of the formal appeal process the utilization review agent
3 denies the appeal, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to notify the member
4 with notice of the option to proceed to an external independent review.
5

6 III. Freestanding Urgent Care Centers.

7 A. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to
8 credential or recredential freestanding urgent care providers.
9

10 IV. Contract Termination; Duty To Report; Provision For Continued Services
11 During Insolvency.

12 A. During the Examination Period, in 38% of provider contracts reviewed,
13 Humana Health Plan, Inc. failed to include a statement that requires the
14 provider to provide services to enrollees under certain circumstances if
15 Humana were to become insolvent or the language was incorrect.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2 **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**
3

4 I. Jurisdiction.

5 The Director has the authority to enter and enforce this Order. A.R.S. § 20-
6 142.

7 II. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals.

8 A. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
9 20-2533(C) by failing to provide a health care appeals information packet to
10 the member within five business days after the date the appeal was
11 initiated.

12 B. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
13 20-2533(D) by failing to notify the member of the right to appeal or failed to
14 issue an explanation of benefits document that provided the member the
15 correct timeframe to file an appeal.

16 C. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
17 20-2534(A) by an initial determination letter that appeared to provide the
18 company discretion in deciding if an appeal that was certified by a provider
19 would be heard as an expedited appeal.

20 D. During PEP 3, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. § 20-2534(B) by
21 failing, in requests for expedited medical review, to inform the member and
22 the member's treating provider of the expedited decision within one
23 business day.

24 E. During PEP 3, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. § 20-2534(C) by
25 failing, in requests for an expedited medical review where there was an

1 adverse decision, to notify the member or the member's treating provider
2 by telephone and mail of the adverse decision or of the member's option to
3 immediately proceed to an expedited appeal.

4 F. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
5 20-2535(B) by failing, in requests for informal reconsideration, to mail a
6 written acknowledgment to the member within five business days after
7 receiving the request, or failed to mail a written acknowledgment to the
8 member's treating provider within five business days after receiving the
9 request or failed to do either.

10 G. During PEPs 2 and 4, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. § 20-
11 2535(D) by failing, in informal reconsiderations, to mail notice of its
12 decision to the member within thirty days after receiving a request for
13 informal reconsideration, or to mail notice of its decision to the member's
14 treating provider within thirty days after receipt of a request for informal
15 reconsideration, or to include the criteria used and the clinical reasons for
16 the decision.

17 H. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
18 20-2536(B) by failing, in formal appeals, to mail a written acknowledgment
19 to the member and the member's treating provider within five business
20 days after receiving the formal appeal.

21 I. During PEP 2, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. § 20-2536(E)(2)
22 by failing, in adverse decisions of formal appeals relating to denials of
23 claims that had already been provided, to provide written notice of its
24 adverse decision to the member within sixty days after receipt of the written
25 appeal, or failed to notify the member in writing of the utilization review

1 agent's decision and the criteria used and the clinical reasons for that
2 decision.

- 3 J. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
4 20-2536(G) by failing, in formal appeals when at the conclusion of the
5 formal appeal process the utilization review agent denies the appeal, to
6 notify the member with notice of the option to proceed to an external
7 independent review.

8 III. Freestanding Urgent Care Centers.

- 9 A. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
10 20-1077(3) by failing to credential or recredential freestanding urgent care
11 providers.

12 IV. Contract Termination; Duty To report; Provision For Continued Services During
13 Insolvency.

- 14 A. During the Examination Period, Humana Health Plan, Inc. violated A.R.S. §
15 20-1074(B) by failing in provider contracts to include a statement that
16 requires the provider to provide services to enrollees under certain
17 circumstances if Humana were to become insolvent or the language was
18 incorrect.

1
2 **ORDER**

3 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:**

- 4 1. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals. Within 90 days of the filed date of
5 this Order, Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall submit to the Arizona Department of
6 Insurance for the Director's approval a Corrective Action Plan (CAP 1) regarding its
7 utilization review and health care appeals violations set forth in this Consent Order.
8 CAP 1 shall provide specific steps Humana Health Plan, Inc. has taken or will take
9 by certain dates to assure that by a specified implementation date, Humana Health
10 Plan, Inc. is:
- 11 a. Providing a health care appeals information packet to the member within
12 five business days after the date the appeal was initiated.
 - 13 b. Notifying the member of the right to appeal or issuing an explanation of
14 benefits document that is providing the member the correct timeframe to file
15 an appeal.
 - 16 c. Sending an initial determination letter that does not appear to provide the
17 company discretion to decide if an appeal that was certified by a provider
18 would be heard as an expedited appeal.
 - 19 d. In requests for expedited medical review, notifying the member and the
20 member's treating provider of the expedited decision within one business
21 day.
 - 22 e. In requests for expedited medical review where there was an adverse
23 decision, notifying the member or the member's treating provider by
24 telephone and mail of the adverse decision and of the member's option to
25 immediately proceed to an expedited appeal.

- 1 f. In requests for informal reconsideration, mailing a written acknowledgment
2 to the member within five business days after receipt of the request, or
3 mailing a written acknowledgment to the member's treating provider within
4 five business days after receipt of the request or not failing to do either.
- 5 g. Mailing a notice of its decision to the member within thirty days after receipt
6 of a request for informal reconsideration, or mailing notice of its decision to
7 the member's treating provider within thirty days after receipt of a request
8 for informal reconsideration, or including the criteria used and the clinical
9 reasons for the decision.
- 10 h. In formal appeals, mailing a written acknowledgment to the member and the
11 member's treating provider within five business days after receipt of the
12 formal appeal.
- 13 i. In adverse decisions of formal appeals related to denials of claims that had
14 already been provided, providing a written notice of its adverse decision to
15 the member within sixty days after receipt or written appeal, or notifying the
16 member in writing of the utilization review agent's decision and the criteria
17 used and the clinical reasons for that decision.
- 18 j. In formal appeals, when at the conclusion of the formal appeal process the
19 utilization review agent denies the appeal, notifying the member with notice
20 of the option to proceed to an external independent review.
- 21 2. Freestanding Urgent Care Centers. Within 90 days of the filed date of this Order,
22 Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall submit to the Arizona Department of Insurance for
23 the Director's approval a Corrective Action Plan (CAP 2) that provides specific
24 steps Humana has taken or will take by certain dates to credential and recredential
25 freestanding urgent care providers.

- 1 3. Contract Termination; Duty To Report; Provision For Continued Services During
2 Insolvency. Within 90 days of the filed date of this Order, Humana Health Plan,
3 Inc. shall submit to the Arizona Department of Insurance for the Director's approval
4 a Corrective Action Plan (CAP 3) that provides specific steps Humana has taken or
5 will take to include, in provider contracts, a statement requiring the provider to
6 provide services to enrollees under certain circumstances if Humana were to
7 become insolvent or including the language in statute.
- 8 4. Progress in Development of the CAPs. Until the Director approves each CAP or
9 CAP item, Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall report to the Director each month on its
10 progress in the development of each CAP or CAP item. Each such monthly report
11 shall include a current draft of that CAP or CAP item. The first monthly CAP
12 development reports are due to the Director 30 days from the date of this Order.
- 13 5. Corrective Action Plan Requirements. Each CAP described above shall:
14 a. Specify any items of CAP 1 ('a' through 'j'), CAP 2 and CAP 3 that the
15 Director has either approved as ready for implementation or accepted as
16 implemented before the date of the report and for each one:
17 i. documentation of the implementation or progress toward
18 implementation, as applicable,
19 ii. a plan for post implementation review and follow-up, and
20 iii. the name and contact information for one individual responsible for
21 ongoing implementation of the CAPs.
22 b. Specify any items of CAP 1 ('a' through 'j'), CAP 2 or CAP 3 that the
23 Director has not approved as ready for implementation or accepted as
24 implemented as of the date of the report and for each one include:
25

- i. enough detail to allow the Director to determine whether the CAP will accomplish its purpose,
 - ii. testing before final implementation of the CAP or any item of the CAP,
 - iii. post implementation Quality Improvement review and follow-up, and
 - iv. the name and contact information for one individual responsible and accountable for ongoing implementation of the CAP or any item of the CAP.
 - c. Provide for Humana Health Plan, Inc. to report to the Director each month regarding implementation of each approved CAP or any item of the CAP, in a form that includes documentation and is approved by the Director. If the CAP or any item of the CAP has been implemented, provide documentation that demonstrates the results of the changes. If the CAP or any item of the CAP is in the process of implementation, provide documentation that demonstrates the progress that has been made toward implementation.
 - d. Provide that within 10 business days of receiving notice that the Director has approved the CAP or any item of the CAP, Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall submit to the Director evidence that Humana Health Plan, Inc. has communicated the CAP or any item of the CAP to the appropriate personnel and begun implementation. Evidence of communication and implementation includes, without limitation, memos, bulletins, e-mails, correspondence, procedure manuals, print screens and training materials.
6. Civil Penalty. Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall pay a civil penalty of \$44,375.00 to the Director for deposit in the State General Fund for violations cited above as

1 Conclusions of Law. Humana Health Plan, Inc. shall remit this civil penalty to the
2 Life & Health Division of the Department prior to the Department filing of this Order.

3
4 The Department will file the Report of the Health Insurance Compliance Examination
5 of Humana Health Plan, Inc. upon the filing of this order.

6
7 DATED at Phoenix, Arizona this 20th day of June, 2008.

8
9 

10 Christina Urias
11 Director of Insurance
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2 **CONSENT TO ORDER**

3 1. Humana Health Plan, Inc. has reviewed the foregoing Order and
4 carefully considered it in conjunction with its other business and regulatory
5 requirements. Humana Health Plan, Inc. believes that it is able and prepared to
6 comply fully with the order, notwithstanding any of its other business and regulatory
7 requirements.

8 2. Humana Health Plan, Inc. admits the jurisdiction of the Director of
9 Insurance, State of Arizona, admits the Findings of Fact and consents to the entry of
10 the Conclusions of Law solely for the purposes of resolving the allegations contained
11 in the Report and consents to entry of the Order.

12 3. Humana Health Plan, Inc. is aware of the right to a hearing, at which it
13 may be represented by counsel, present evidence and cross-examine witnesses.
14 Humana Health Plan, Inc. irrevocably waives the right to such notice and hearing and
15 to any court appeals related to this Order.


16 4. Humana Health Plan, Inc. states that no promise of any kind or nature
17 whatsoever was made to it to induce it to enter into this Consent Order and that it has
18 entered into this Consent Order voluntarily.

19 5. Humana Health Plan, Inc. acknowledges that the acceptance of this
20 Order by the Director of the Arizona Department of Insurance is solely for the purpose
21 of settling this matter. This Order does not preclude any other agency or officer of this
22 state or its subdivisions or any other person from instituting proceedings, whether civil,
23 criminal, or administrative, as may be appropriate now or in the future and does not
24 preclude the Department from instituting proceedings as may be appropriate on other
25 matters now or in the future.

6. Gary Goldstein, M.D., who holds the office of Chief Executive Officer – Humana West Region, is authorized to enter into this Order for Humana Health Plan, Inc. and on its behalf.

Humana Health Plan, Inc.

6/2/08
Date

By 
Gary Goldstein, M.D.
Chief Executive Officer – Humana West Region
Humana Health Plan, Inc.

1 **COPY of the foregoing mailed/delivered**
2 **this 24th day of Jun, 2008, to:**

3 Gerrie Marks
4 Deputy Director
5 Mary Butterfield
6 Assistant Director
7 Consumer Affairs Division
8 Paul J. Hogan
9 Market Oversight Division Chief
10 Dean Ehler
11 Assistant Director
12 Rates & Regulations Division
13 Steve Ferguson
14 Assistant Director
15 Financial Affairs Division
16 David Lee
17 Chief Financial Examiner
18 Alexandra Shafer
19 Assistant Director
20 Life and Health Division
21 Terry L. Cooper
22 Fraud Unit Chief

23 ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE
24 2910 North 44th Street, Suite 210
25 Phoenix, AZ 85018

Humana Health Plan, Inc.
Gary Goldstein M.D.,
Chief Executive Officer – Humana West Region
20860 North Tatum Boulevard
Suite 400
Phoenix, AZ 85050

22 
23
24
25